Environment in the Courtroom

http://hdl.handle.net/1880/109483

https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0
Attribution Non-Commercial No Derivatives 4.0 International

Downloaded from PRISM: https://prism.ucalgary.ca
Contributors

PAUL ADAMS, Senior Counsel, Public Prosecution Service Canada, Halifax

NATASHA AFFOLDER, Associate Dean, Faculty of Law, University of British Columbia, Vancouver

ANDREA C. AKELAITIS, Letcher Akelaitis LLP, Vancouver

PETER BOXALL, Professor, Department of Resource Economics & Environmental Sociology, University of Alberta, Edmonton

GIORILYN BRUNO, DLA Piper (Canada) LLP

JAMES BUNTING, Davies, Ward, Phillips & Vineberg LLP, Toronto

CINDY CHIASSON, Alberta Energy Regulator, Edmonton

JOHN S.G. CLARK, Department of Justice, Vancouver

JOHN D. CLIFFE, Q.C., Cliffe Tobias, Vancouver

LYNDA COLLINS, Professor, Faculty of Law, Common Law, University of Ottawa

JACK D. COOP, Fogler, Rubinoff LLP, Toronto

CHARLES-EMMANUEL CÔTÉ, Professor, Faculty of Law, Laval University
PETER J. CRAIG, Senior Crown Attorney, Nova Scotia Public Prosecution Service, Dartmouth

PIERRE-OLIVIER DESMARCHAIS, Policy Analyst, Policy Horizons Canada, Government of Canada

ADAM DRIEDZIC, Staff Counsel, Environmental Law Centre (Alberta) Society, Edmonton

ERIN EACOTT, Public Prosecution Service of Canada, Edmonton

JENNIFER FAIRFAX, Partner, Osler, Hoskin & Harcourt LLP, Toronto

JAMES FLAGAL, Counsel, Ontario Ministry of the Environment and Climate Change, Toronto

SHAUN FLUKER, Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Calgary

HADLEY FRIEDLAND, Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Alberta, Edmonton

PAULE HALLEY, Professor, Faculty of Law, Laval University

CHARLES HATT, Staff Lawyer, Ecojustice, Toronto

BRENDA HEELAN POWELL, Staff Counsel, Environmental Law Centre, Edmonton

NICHOLAS R. HUGHES, McCarthy Tétrault, Vancouver

ALEX IKEJIANI, Department of Justice, Fisheries and Oceans Legal Services, Government of Canada, Ottawa

ALLAN E. INGELSON, Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Calgary

ASHA JAMES, Managing Associate, Falconers LLP, Toronto
Meredith James, Environmental Lawyer, City of Toronto

Albert Koehl, Former Staff Lawyer, Ecojustice, Toronto

David Laidlaw, Research Fellow, Canadian Institute of Resources Law, Calgary

Jonathan Leo, Former Attorney, State Bar of California

Gary A. Letcher, Letcher Akelaitis LLP, Vancouver

Alastair R. Lucas, Q.C., Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Calgary

Fred Maefs, Crown Counsel, Ontario Ministry of the Environment and Climate Change, Toronto

Sharon Mascher, Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Calgary

Marc McAree, Partner, Willms & Shier Environmental Lawyers LLP, Toronto

Paul McCulloch, Crown Counsel, Ministry of the Environment and Climate Change, Ottawa

Heather McLeod-Kilmurray, Professor, Faculty of Law, Common Law, University of Ottawa

Susan McRory, Former Environmental Prosecutor, Specialized Prosecutions Branch, Government of Alberta, Edmonton

Danielle Meuleman, Crown Counsel, Ontario Ministry of the Attorney General, Toronto

Nickie Nikolaou, Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Calgary

Terri-Lee Oleniuk, Osler, Hoskin & Harcourt LLP, Calgary
MARTIN OLSZYNKI, Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Calgary

KATIA OPALKA, Senior Manager, Pratt & Whitney Canada Corp, Quebec

JEAN PIETTE, Norton Rose Fulbright, Québec

SARAH POWELL, Davies, Ward, Phillips & Vineberg, Toronto

PHILLIP SAUNDERS, Professor, Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University, Halifax

MONIKA A. SAWICKA, McCarthy Tétrault, Vancouver

DR. DIANNE SAXE, Environmental Commissioner of Ontario, Government of Ontario, Toronto

CHERYL SHARVIT, Mandell Pinder LLP, Vancouver

ANAND SRIVASTAVA, Associate Lawyer, Willms & Shier Environmental Lawyers LLP, Toronto

BARRY STUART, Retired Judge, Vancouver

JOHN SWAIGEN, Staff Lawyer, Ecojustice, Toronto

CHRIS TOLLEFSON, Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Victoria

RONDA M. VANDERHOEK, Counsel, Public Prosecution Service of Canada, Halifax

JASMINE VAN SCHOUWEN, Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa

MICHAEL M. WENIG, Natural Resources Conservation Board, Calgary

ROBERT WOON, Associate Lawyer, Willms & Shier Environmental Lawyers LLP, Toronto
Index

A
Aboriginal law, 285
Aboriginal traditional knowledge, 606–27
absolute liability offences, 231, 263;
corporations, 313, 323, 326, 328, 379, 724; deeming, provisions, 475; defences, 180–81, 202, 204, 231, 272, 273, 282, 286, 282, 301, 726, 736, 740, 768, 773; defined, 231; general deterrence, 365, 380, 383, 388, 394, 437, 438, 453, 456, 675, 742, 762
abuse of process, 243, 272–76, 279, 581
acts of God, 181, 740
administrative decisions, 352
administrative law, 20, 231, 619–20
administrative orders, 199, 700
administrative penalties, 338–59
administrative tribunals, 81, 532, 534, 539, 547–48, 559, 593–95
admissibility of expert evidence and costs, 516–30
assessing environmental damages, 162–68

B
balance of probabilities, 155, 198, 232, 234, 244, 263, 264, 270, 452, 473, 526, 584, 586, 591, 592, 639, 720, 721, 734, 756, 769, 773
beyond a reasonable doubt, 197, 205, 219, 226, 231–33, 244, 251, 267, 271, 452, 453, 473, 575, 720

Brundtland Report, 2, 4, 8, 94
bylaws, 24, 187, 242

C
Canada National Parks Act, 46, 50, 133, 134, 135, 138, 423, 445
Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, 6, 13, 72, 178, 255, 342, 344, 348, 358, 478, 666, 713, 770
Canadian Environmental Assessment Act, 14, 22, 106, 129, 161, 610, 623, 628, 631
causation and scientific certainty, 473–80
Certificates of Approval, 194
classification as strict/absolute liability
offence, 180; reverse onus, 198, 719
Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms, 14, 72, 75, 77, 80, 348, 358, 360
citizen participation, 14
Civil Code of Quebec, 44
civil law, xi, 52, 144, 146, 292
class action, 56, 58, 67, 71, 190, 560, 654
classification of offenses: quasi-criminal
offence, 205, 668, 726
Clean Water Act, 253, 677, 687–88, 795
climatic change, 233, 144, 646–61
codes of conduct, 322
collecting essential evidence, 718–39
communications between lawyers and
experts, 494–503
compliance regimes, 708–16
compliance audit, 715, 780
Constitution Act 1867, 143, 289
Constitution Act 1982, 13, 140, 186, 286, 287, 296, 609
constitutional jurisdiction, 54; federal jurisdiction, 207, 621; provincial jurisdiction, 207
continuing offences, 428, 745
control, 321, 322; ability to restrain or prevent activities, 321, 322
corporate perspective on creative environmental sentences, 391–408
corporations, liability of, 313, 323, 326, 328, 379, 724; circumstances necessary for conviction, 326, 327; corporate veil, 367; directing minds, 335, 756
cost of compliance: costs, 244, 249, 250, 294, 527, 528
creative sentences, 391, 393, 395, 406, 416–18, 422; in Australia 377–86; negotiation, 436–41; sentencing, 364–72, 377, 381, 384–85, 391–95, 406, 408, 413, 415–18, 420–21, 430, 435, 438, 439. See also corporate perspective on creative environmental sentences; non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and creative sentencing
criminal law of the environment and defences, 272–82
customary international law, 20–21, 29, 75, 80, 102, 142–46, 149–50, 152, 157, 299

D
damages, 56–57, 59, 166–68, 316, 464
defences, 180, 181, 272, 273, 279, 282; abuse of process, 272; acts of God, 181; officially induced error, 182, 272, 274, 276
directing mind of corporations 335, 756; generally, 756; principles, 756
directors, liability of, 324, 428, 724, 725, 767; statutory duty of care, 329; steps to avoid liability, 181, 723, 737
directors and officers, liability of, 324, 428, 724, 725, 767; legislation imposing positive duty, 724
disclosure of defence evidence, 726, 732
discretionary decisions, 719
due diligence, 180, 181, 262–70, 353, 757; reasonable care, whether exercised, 477, 722–24, 756–57; relationship between due diligence defence and acts of God, 180–81; relationship between due diligence defence and mistake of fact defence, 180–82; relationship between due diligence defence and necessity defence, 272, 279; standard of care. See standard of care
duty of care: scope, 188–91, 691
duty to notify and consult, 607, 611, 615, 619–22

E
ecological integrity, vi, xii, 11, 46, 93, 94, 96, 98, 100, 103, 131–40
economic instruments, 699
ecosystem management, xii, 39–51
ecosystem services, 15, 98, 444, 455, 469
employees and agents, liability of, 428–29, 788–90
employer, liability, of 200–201
endangered species, 23, 26, 33, 34, 46, 135, 165, 452, 460
Endangered Species Act, 23, 26, 112, 123, 609, 612, 613, 623, 624
entry and inspection, powers, 777
Environment and Climate Change Canada, 40, 221, 296, 370, 371, 416, 418, 445, 462, 694–96, 760
environmental assessment law, 8; federal process, 74; framework, 64; future of, 8; Ontario process 64; principles and evolution, 64
environmental assessment, 8, 98–99, 134, 135, 253, 281, 552, 592, 608, 614, 620, 747
Environmental Assessment Act (Ontario), 64, 253
environmental assessment and review process, 156
environmental audit, 382–83, 642, 700, 780–81, 794
Environmental Bill of Rights (Ontario), 1993 64, 125, 256
Environmental Commissioner, 256, 802
environmental concerns, 4, 66, 167, 251, 613, 725
environmental damages, 163
environmental ethics, 61
environmental harm and economics, 443–54; 457–68
environmental impact assessments, 98, 99, 281
environmental investigations, 742–50
environmental law, 64, 65, 72, 73, 143, 144, 149, 152, 154–56, 187, 443, 445, 473, 477; component goals, 64–65, 282; international law, relevance to, 102; key components of, 224; tort law, 195, 231
environmental norms, 131
environmental prosecutions, 173
environmental protection, 227, 282, 309, 309, 325, 337, 367, 369, 416, 437, 608, 693, 742; use of compliance audits, 780
Environmental Protection Act (Ontario) 21, 205, 238, 252, 254, 273, 281, 353, 473, 652, 708, 724
Environmental Protection and Enhancement Act (Alberta), 48, 107, 212, 237, 246, 252, 394, 416, 418, 420, 609, 613, 615
Environmental Quality Act (Quebec), 724
Environmental Review Tribunal, 25, 205, 335, 478, 530, 536, 591, 597, 711–12
environmental sentencing, 66
errors of law, 182, 272, 274–77, 354, 515; generally 274–75. See also mistake of law
evidence, 177–86, 203, 204, 234–23; evidence continuity 574–81; evidentiary barriers to standing 582; evidentiary issues in environmental prosecutions and hearings 471
experts, 481–92; 493–503; 532–48, 561–73; expert evidence, 516, 531, 551–59

F
federal jurisdiction, 144, 207, 621
federal v provincial Crowning, 207–17
First Nations, 137, 242, 243, 298, 608, 615. See also Indigenous peoples
Fisheries and Oceans Canada, 368, 370–71, 694
Fisheries Act, 22, 26, 28, 29, 179, 183–85, 219, 222, 225, 249, 262, 269, 314, 369, 622, 694, 695
fisheries sector, 694
foreseeability, 188, 189, 193, 265, 378, 721, 757
Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act (Ontario), 245
fundamental justice, 77; abuse of process, 243, 272–76, 279, 581; improper exercise of prosecutorial discretion, 176, 194, 246, 325
G
gathering expert evidence, 597–604
government action/inaction, 10, 100
government officials, liability of, 255, 354
guidelines, 108, 395, 418, 783, 788
H
habitat loss, 199
hazardous waste, 200, 678, 730
hearsay evidence, 599
human rights and environmental law, 72
I
impact assessments. See Environmental impact assessments
Indigenous legal traditions, 82
initiation of action, 708–16
injunction, 6, 33, 56, 68, 298, 347, 701
inspections, 178–80, 198, 663–85, 785; inspections and searches, 178; inspections vs. investigations, 709
Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, 253, 646
international environmental law, 152–60
international law, 102, 142–49
intragovernmental aspects of prosecutions, 218
Index

J
joint prosecutions, 211
judicial notice of climate change, 646–58
judicial review, 23–24, 26–27, 54, 66, 134–35, 137, 13, 153, 158, 240, 244, 592, 612, 638
judicial treatment of regulatory offences: plea-bargaining, 315
jurisdiction, 201, 207, 208, 245

L
land use planning, 112, 113, 126, 615, 624, 690, 691
laws of general application, 343, 699
Law of the Sea Treaty, 36
leave to appeal, 23, 71, 186, 190, 260, 501, 591–92, 659, 750
legislative reform, 593
liability, 57, 77, 189, 194, 329, 428

M
marine protection: conservation areas, 608, 614; protected areas, 98, 132, 490, 617
mens rea, 231, 263, 715
mistake of law: defence of officially induced error, 182, 272, 274, 276
monetary administrative penalties, 338
Municipal Act (Ontario), 259

N
national parks, 131–39, 385. See also Parks Canada
National Pollutant Release Inventory, 613
necessity, defence of, 279–80; defined 279–80 negligence, 55, 187
negotiating sentences, 425–35
non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and creative sentencing, 413–22
North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation, 148, 694, 705
nuisance, 52–59

O
Oceans. See Fisheries and Oceans Canada
oil and gas, 72, 398
Ontario Municipal Board, 650
Ontario Water Resources Act, 125, 231, 247, 253, 256, 273, 327, 475, 480, 670, 677, 688, 689, 708, 716, 724, 739

P
Parks Canada, 133–39. See also ecosystem management; national parks
participation rights, 537, 589
penalties, 338–58, 684, 685
pollution prevention, 65, 220, 222, 368, 613, 694, 695
precautionary principle, 17–36, 97
preventive measures orders, 709
private actions, 58
private prosecutions, 240–56
privilege in environmental enforcement, 634–44
procedural fairness, 354, 535
prosecutions, 173–85
prosecutorial discretion, 175–85, 194, 246, 325
provincial parks, 58, 125
public interest standing, 584–87, 591, 593
public international law, 152
public lands, 45, 46
public nuisance, 52–57, 59, 584–85
public participation, 2, 5–7, 10
Public Prosecution Service of Canada, 224

Q
quasi-judicial, 352, 588, 700, 701, 702

R
reasonable care, defence of, 180, 181, 353, 477, 722–24, 756–57; relationship to acts of God, 181
reasonable person, 26, 264, 275, 333, 354
recapitulation, 752–75; 776–92
Index

record, 85, 237
regulatory inspections, 690–98
regulatory negligence, 187–95
remedial orders, 393, 439
remedy, 53–59, 68
reporting obligations to third parties, 505–14
responsive regulation, 665–87

S
Sault Ste. Marie (case), 177, 183, 200, 244, 254, 263, 272, 336, 353, 714, 721
special damages, 56
species at risk, 155, 158, 612
Species at Risk Act, 22, 29, 65, 155, 238, 247, 252
specific deterrence, 456
standard of care, 188, 365, 765
standard of proof, 231, 232, 234, 264, 582, 584–92
standard of review, 521, 620
standard setting, 690; enforcement 690
standing, 53, 582, 586; evidentiary barriers 582–93
statutory due diligence defences, 267
statutory interpretation, 29, 75, 139, 149, 153, 201
strategic decisions in environmental prosecutions, 197–206
strict liability (offences), 68, 177, 197, 231, 232, 263, 720; defence of reasonable care (see reasonable care, defence of); defences, 268; errors of law, acts of God 354; generally, 263; other defences 253, 263
subsidiary, 747
substantive environmental rights, 74, 240
sustainable development, 1–10, 104; forest resources, 118, 127; intergenerational equity, 9, 64, 96, 97; oceans, 107; operationalizing 11, 92; precautionary principle, 2
sustainability, 92–127
sustainability statutes, 104–28
Sustainable Development Act (Manitoba), 10, 12, 51, 64, 99, 106, 109

t

tort law, 195, 231
Toxic Substances List, 220
training, 382
Transportation of Dangerous Goods Act, 374, 375
treaty, 97, 103, 144–50
trespass, 67, 68, 655, 661
tribunal, 205, 336, 352; evidence, 177–86, 203, 204, 234–37; judicial review of tribunal decisions, 23, 24, 27, 54, 134, 240; natural justice, and, 619; parties, 54, 103, 231, 699; procedural fairness, and, 354, 535
Truth and Reconciliation Commission Calls to Action, 299

U
UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, 298
UN Framework Convention on Climate Change, 11

V
voluntary compliance, 393, 680, 700, 742, 754, 767

W
watershed management, 42–45, 47, 49–51
wetlands, 28, 42, 328
wildlife sector. Aboriginal rights, 622; migratory birds, 155, 221
wildlife statutes: species at risk, 22, 50, 65, 155, 158, 241, 612, 616, 629
whistleblowers, 198, 636, 743, 790, 791, 797
World Commission on Environment and Development, 2, 4, 8, 94
Canadian environmental law is a dynamic and exciting area that is playing an increasingly important role in furthering sustainable development policy. Environmental law has distinctive principles and distinctive provincial and federal statutes and regulations. These must be appreciated both within the legal community and by all those who are concerned about the way that courts and tribunals resolve environmental disputes.

*Environment in the Courtroom* provides extensive insight into Canadian environmental law. Covering key environmental concepts and the unique nature of environmental damage, environmental prosecutions, sentencing and environmental offences, evidentiary issues in court and in hearings, issues associated with site inspections, investigations, and enforcement, and more, this collection has the potential to make a significant difference in the level of understanding and practice.

Providing perspective and insight from experienced and prominent Canadian legal practitioners and scholars, *Environment in the Courtroom* addresses the Canadian provinces and territories and provides context by comparison to the United States and Australia. No other collection of practical papers covers these topics so comprehensively. This is an essential reference for all those interested in Canadian environmental law.

**ALLAN E. INGELSON** is an associate professor in the Faculty of Law, University of Calgary, and Executive Director of the Canadian Institute of Resources Law. His research focuses on Canadian and international energy, mining, and environmental issues.