



RECONSIDERING CONFEDERATION: Canada's Founding Debates, 1864-1999

Edited by Daniel Heidt

ISBN 978-1-77385-016-0

THIS BOOK IS AN OPEN ACCESS E-BOOK. It is an electronic version of a book that can be purchased in physical form through any bookseller or on-line retailer, or from our distributors. Please support this open access publication by requesting that your university purchase a print copy of this book, or by purchasing a copy yourself. If you have any questions, please contact us at ucpress@ucalgary.ca

Cover Art: The artwork on the cover of this book is not open access and falls under traditional copyright provisions; it cannot be reproduced in any way without written permission of the artists and their agents. The cover can be displayed as a complete cover image for the purposes of publicizing this work, but the artwork cannot be extracted from the context of the cover of this specific work without breaching the artist's copyright.

COPYRIGHT NOTICE: This open-access work is published under a Creative Commons licence. This means that you are free to copy, distribute, display or perform the work as long as you clearly attribute the work to its authors and publisher, that you do not use this work for any commercial gain in any form, and that you in no way alter, transform, or build on the work outside of its use in normal academic scholarship without our express permission. If you want to reuse or distribute the work, you must inform its new audience of the licence terms of this work. For more information, see details of the Creative Commons licence at: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>

UNDER THE CREATIVE COMMONS LICENCE YOU MAY:

- read and store this document free of charge;
- distribute it for personal use free of charge;
- print sections of the work for personal use;
- read or perform parts of the work in a context where no financial transactions take place.

UNDER THE CREATIVE COMMONS LICENCE YOU MAY NOT:

- gain financially from the work in any way;
- sell the work or seek monies in relation to the distribution of the work;
- use the work in any commercial activity of any kind;
- profit a third party indirectly via use or distribution of the work;
- distribute in or through a commercial body (with the exception of academic usage within educational institutions such as schools and universities);
- reproduce, distribute, or store the cover image outside of its function as a cover of this work;
- alter or build on the work outside of normal academic scholarship.



Acknowledgement: We acknowledge the wording around open access used by Australian publisher, **re.press**, and thank them for giving us permission to adapt their wording to our policy <http://www.re-press.org>

Edited by
**DANIEL
HEIDT**



Reconsidering Confederation

CANADA'S FOUNDING DEBATES
1864-1999

Reconsidering Confederation





UNIVERSITY OF CALGARY
Press

Reconsidering Confederation

CANADA'S FOUNDING DEBATES
1864-1999



Edited by
DANIEL HEIDT

© 2018 Daniel Heidt

University of Calgary Press
2500 University Drive NW
Calgary, Alberta
Canada T2N 1N4
press.ucalgary.ca

This book is available as an ebook which is licensed under a Creative Commons license. The publisher should be contacted for any commercial use which falls outside the terms of that license.

LIBRARY AND ARCHIVES CANADA CATALOGUING IN PUBLICATION

Reconsidering confederation : Canada's founding
debates, 1864-1999 / edited by Daniel Heidt.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Issued in print and electronic formats.

ISBN 978-1-77385-015-3 (softcover).—ISBN 978-1-77385-016-0

(open access PDF).—ISBN 978-1-77385-017-7 (PDF).—

ISBN 978-1-77385-018-4 (EPUB).—ISBN 978-1-77385-019-1 (Kindle)

1. Canada—History—Confederation, 1867. I. Heidt, Daniel
(Daniel Henry), 1985-, editor

FC474.R37 2018

971.04'9

C2018-904065-3

C2018-904066-1

The University of Calgary Press acknowledges the support of the Government of Alberta through the Alberta Media Fund for our publications. We acknowledge the financial support of the Government of Canada. We acknowledge the financial support of the Canada Council for the Arts for our publishing program.

This book has been published with the help of a grant from the Canadian Federation for the Humanities and Social Sciences, through the Awards to Scholarly Publications Program, using funds provided by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada.

This book has been published with the support of the Crabtree Foundation.



Canada Council
for the Arts

Conseil des Arts
du Canada

CRABTREE FOUNDATION

Copyediting by Francine Michaud

Cover design, page design, and typesetting by Melina Cusano

Contents

Illustrations	<i>vii</i>
Acknowledgments	<i>ix</i>
1 Introduction: Reconsidering Confederation DANIEL HEIDT	 1
2 Compact, Contract, Covenant: The Evolution of First Nations Treaty-Making J.R. MILLER	 19
3 Ontario: The Centre of Confederation? DANIEL HEIDT	 53
4 Quebec and Confederation: Gains and Compromise MARCEL MARTEL, COLIN M. COATES, MARTIN PÂQUET, AND MAXIME GOHIER	 75
5 The Maritimes and the Debate Over Confederation PHILLIP BUCKNER	 101
6 Resisting Canada’s Will: Manitoba’s Entry into Confederation ROBERT WARDHAUGH AND BARRY FERGUSON	 145
7 “The interests of Confederation demanded it”: British Columbia and Confederation PATRICIA E. ROY	 171

8 “It is better to have a half loaf than none at all”: The Yukon and Confederation	193
P. WHITNEY LACKENBAUER AND KEN S. COATES	
9 Creating New Provinces: Saskatchewan and Alberta	213
BILL WAISER	
10 Newfoundland and Canada: Confederation and the Search for Stability	237
RAYMOND B. BLAKE	
11 “A More Accurate Face on Canada to the World”: The Creation of Nunavut	263
P. WHITNEY LACKENBAUER AND ANDRÉ LÉGARÉ	
Confederation Quotes: Sources and Further Reading	291
Contributors	297
Index	303

Illustrations

1.1	Canada, with its current provincial and territorial borders.	14
2.1	Historical Treaties of Canada. Developed from Canada, “Historical Treaties of Canada,” <i>Indigenous and Northern Affairs Canada</i> , https://www.aadnc-aandc.gc.ca/DAM/DAM-INTER-HQ/STAGING/texte-text/htoc_1100100032308_eng.pdf .	21
3.1	British North America’s settler political boundaries as they existed in 1867. Developed from Natural Resources Canada, “Map 1867,” <i>Library and Archives Canada</i> , https://www.collectionscanada.gc.ca/confederation/023001-5005-e.html .	55
3.2	The Charlottetown delegates, 1 September 1864. photograph by George P. Roberts, LAC, C-000733.	58
6.1	The Red River settlement, 1870, showing the locations of the predominantly French and English parishes. Developed from: Gerhard J. Ens, <i>Homeland to Hinterland: The Changing Worlds of the Metis in the Nineteenth Century</i> (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996), 11; Gerald Friesen, <i>The Canadian Prairies: A History</i> (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1987), 91; Norma Jean Hall, “The People,” <i>The Provisional Government of Assiniboia</i> , https://hallnjean2.wordpress.com/resources/definition-provisional-government/the-people-electorate/ ; George Stanley, <i>The Birth of Western Canada: A History of The Riel Rebellions</i> , 2 nd edition (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1961), 14.	148
6.2	Manitoba’s expansion, 1870–1912. Reproduced with permission from John Welsted et al. “Manitoba: Geographical Identity of a Prairie Province,” <i>The Geography of Manitoba: Its Land and Its People</i> , eds. John C. Everitt, Christoph Stadel and John E. Welsted (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 1996), 5.	162
7.1	The BC delegation of Dr. J.S. Helmcken, Dr. R.W.W. Carrall and J.W. Trutch departing for Ottawa to negotiate the terms of union with Canada. Image PDP00488 by Robert Banks, courtesy of the Royal BC Museum and Archives.	183

8.1	Yukon miners being chased from power by the Yukon Council and Ottawa “monsters.” <i>Dawson Daily</i> , 19 May 1903.	198
9.1	The North-West demanding “justice” for the North-West. <i>The Grip</i> , November 1883.	224
9.2	The proposed province of “Buffalo.” Reproduced with permission from Bill Waiser, <i>Saskatchewan: A New History</i> (Calgary: Fifth House, 2006).	228
9.3	Laurier as the proud father of two provincial “twins.” <i>Montreal Daily Star</i> , 23 February 1905.	230
10.1	The Ottawa Delegation of the National Convention, 1947. Photographer: G. Hunter. LAC, MIKAN 3362966.	250
10.2	Anti-Confederate Campaign, 1948. Courtesy of the Rooms Provincial Archives Division, George Carter Collection, Box 5, MG910.	253
10.3	<i>The Confederate</i> , 31 May 1948, 3.	254
10.4	Rt. Hon. Louis St. Laurent speaking during the ceremony which admitted Newfoundland into Confederation. Ottawa, Ontario, 1 April 1949. LAC, MIKAN 3408569.	258
11.1	Canada at the beginning of the 20 th century, before the federal government created Alberta as well as Saskatchewan, and extended the northern boundaries of Manitoba, Ontario, and Quebec. Developed from Natural Resources Canada, “Map 1898,” <i>Library and Archives Canada</i> , https://www.collectionscanada.gc.ca/confederation/023001-5009-e.html .	265
11.2	Northern NDP MP Peter Ittinuar. NWT Archives/©GNWT. Department of Public Works and Services/G-1995-001: 0539.	274
11.3	Nunavut, as established in 1999. Reproduced from: “Nunavut with Names,” <i>Natural Resources Canada</i> , http://ftp.geogratis.gc.ca/pub/nrcan_rncan/raster/atlas_6_ed/reference/bilingual/nunavut_names.pdf .	279
11.4	The Northwest Territories after the establishment of Nunavut in 1999. Reproduced from: “Northwest Territories with Names,” http://ftp.geogratis.gc.ca/pub/nrcan_rncan/raster/atlas_6_ed/reference/bilingual/nwt_names.pdf .	283

Acknowledgments

This book's genesis can be traced to the origins of *The Confederation Debates*, which sought to familiarize Canadians with the debates that shaped their country's founding during the past one and a half centuries. The project digitized roughly nine thousand pages of text from local and federal legislatures debating the admission of each province or territory into Confederation, between 1865 and 1949, as well as the Numbered Treaties and records of their negotiation, and posted these records to our legacy website hosted by the University of Victoria (<http://hcmc.uvic.ca/confederation/>).

From the outset, contributors from across the country diligently worked to package portions of these records into educational mini-units, social media posts, and other deliverables, and the project's leadership recognized that the records would be much more meaningful if they were accompanied by primers concerning each province, territory, and Treaty area's entry into Confederation.

Towards this end, a group of Canada's leading historians congregated at St. Jerome's University in February 2017 to share and discuss papers detailing each province, territory, and Treaty areas' journeys into Confederation. Everyone was impressed by the collective strength of the research as well as the thoughtful analysis emphasizing a common (though diverse) pursuit of local autonomy, and the decision was quickly made to submit the papers for scholarly publication. The result is *Reconsidering Confederation*.

This book would not have been possible without the continuous support and guidance provided by Raymond B. Blake, Penny Bryden, Colin

M. Coates, P. Whitney Lackenbauer, and Marcel Martel. I am also deeply grateful to all of the chapter contributors for their carefully considered work and fast turnaround times. Support from the Crabtree Foundation, the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council, St. Jerome's University, the University of Waterloo, and the Canada150@York fund helped to make this book a reality. Several research assistants, including Yuqian (Gloria) Fan, Sumedha Jain, and Phil Thompson also helped to prepare the manuscript for publication.

The book is also indebted to the University of British Columbia Press for granting us permission to reproduce J.R. Miller's chapter from *New Histories for Old: Changing Perspectives on Canada's Native Pasts*. The authors of this volume are also appreciative for the constructive feedback offered by the anonymous peer reviewers.