

<b>Title of class:</b> Systematic Review Workshop 1: Setting yourself up for success	
<b>Bridge:</b> You would never consider doing a primary study without having a research plan and protocol, so why would a Knowledge Synthesis review be any different? The activities/time/effort spent in planning your review (just like other research) will ensure smooth sailing and success in later stages. Very iterative in nature during the planning phase as you learn more about the topic, the scope of the literature, etc.	
<b>Learning Outcome(s):</b> By the end of this session, students will be able to <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Understand the importance of a protocol for a systematic review</li> <li>• Describe the elements of a systematic review protocol</li> <li>• Create a researchable question using a question framework</li> <li>• Develop inclusion/exclusion criteria</li> <li>• Define subject headings and keywords and understand the differences between them</li> <li>• Find and analyze seed/known papers for keywords and subject headings</li> </ul>	
<b>Pre-assessment:</b> Poll: How familiar are you with SR methods? Poll: Have you participated in a SR before?	
<b>Teaching and Learning Activities:</b> Combination of lecture, live demonstrations, Q&As and student activities	
<b>Instructor Activities</b>	<b>Learner Activities</b>
1) What is knowledge/evidence synthesis 2) Systematic versus scoping review: what are the differences 3) Defining your question (using a question framework). What are question frameworks, what does PICO stand for and showing worked examples of PICO 4) Creating your protocol/plan – Why/When and introduce PRISMA-P 5) Choosing your information sources – Information types/disciplines 6) Developing inclusion/exclusion criteria. What are they, how detailed should it be, and common types of criteria used including one specific example 7) Doing a pre-scan of the literature and identifying seed papers (Why, how, and what kind of papers to select as seed articles) 8) Analyzing the titles/abstracts of seed papers to find keywords 9) Introduce subject headings and how to search for seed papers in chosen databases to find subject headings attached to the records	3) PICO activity (5 min). Students use “Is Social Media harmful” as a broad question and refine it by adding additional PICO elements to create a researchable question. Google forms is used to submit responses. Instructor debrief shows the breadth of questions submitted by students.  6) Inclusion/Exclusion activity (5 minutes) Students stand-up (or select Yes on zoom) initially and sit down (switch to No on zoom) if they meet an exclusion criterion – based on a set of questions  8/9) Mining seed papers activity (10 minutes) Students search up a series of titles in a database to locate the article record. They analyze the record and extract keyword and subject headings which are submitted to a concept table in a Google Doc.

### Post-assessment:

- 3) Quick assessment and discussion of the types and PICO elements of research questions that were submitted through Google Forms (while sharing the results on the screen)
- 6) Post-activity discussion with the students and Q&A with the last students to sit down and those remaining standing
- 8/9) Quick assessment of the terms/subject headings suggested in the concept table followed by a discussion with students about it, including whether some of the terms were appropriate/relevant and put into the right box of the concept table.

### Summary:

Stress the importance to spending time to refine the question, consider PICO elements and eligibility criteria, create a protocol, find seed papers and analyze them to create a working concept table containing keyword terms and subject headings.

## Screenshots of Activities

### 3) PICO activity

Questions   Responses   40

---

Image title

Research Question 1: Is social media harmful?

Population –  
Intervention – **Social Media**  
Comparison –  
Outcome –

Researchable question:

**Instructions**

1. Identify any possible PICO elements from the provided research question(s) and fill them into the PICO template. This has partially been done for you.
2. Come up with the remaining PICO elements using your creativity.
3. Is your Outcome measurable, if not revise it to one that is.
4. Create a one-sentence research(able) question that incorporates at least 3 PICO elements.

What is the population for your research question? \*

Short answer text

What is the intervention for your research question? \*

Your answer \_\_\_\_\_

What is the comparison for your research question? \*

Your answer \_\_\_\_\_

What is the outcome for your research question? \*

Your answer \_\_\_\_\_

What is your final research question that incorporates all PICO elements? \*

Your answer \_\_\_\_\_

**Submit**

## 6) Inclusion/Exclusion activity

Inclusion Criteria



Exclusion Criteria



Created by: Dr. Zahra Premji (zahra.premji@ucalgary.ca) & Dr. K. Alix Hayden (ahayden@ucalgary.ca)



## Questions to ask for the inclusion/exclusion criteria activity

1. Everyone click on “participants” at the bottom of the zoom screen, and then click the



“Yes” button (  yes  no )

2. If you are NOT from the University of Calgary then change your response to the No

3. This study is about pet therapy, so if you do not have a pet, then change your response to No, and those with pets remain with Yes selected

4. This study is about dogs, so those who have a cat, rabbit, snake, bird, etc, please change your response to No.

Discussion: Did anyone here have both a Dog and a Cat/Rabbit/Bird? Which did you pick?

## 8/9) Mining seed papers activity – via Google Docs

Screenshot of example shown to students

**Mining seed papers**

Meeting the emotion! Application of the Federico II Model to pet therapy in an experience of Animal Assisted Education (AAE) in a primary school. [References]

Dice, F., Santarelli, A., Geraci, F., Menna, L.F., Ewale, M.F., *Pratiques Psychologiques*, 2017, pp. 435-463  
AN\_20170328P-009

**Textwords for pet therapy concept**

Animal Assisted Education (AAE) intervention, primary school aimed to promote, in children, interaction with animals, helping them to recognize their own emotions and those of others. Generally, these interventions are considered as a valid support for children with emotional or behavioral disorders, but they can also be an interest of Health Psychology as a protective factor against mental distress, anxiety and difficulties in training programs. In this paper, authors propose an intervention model according to the Federico II Model of Pet Therapy (FIM-PT) in a team work made by a psychologist and a veterinarian, with a specific training in Human-Animal Interaction (HAI), a dog and three donkeys. The intervention involves 21 students belonging to a third grade class (8 years old), aimed to promote a contact with primary emotions such as joy, anger, fear, sadness, disgust, surprise. The proposed activities, guided by a playful approach, helped children to recognize and understand these emotions and to develop their relational skills. (PsycINFO Database Record (c) 2018 APA, all rights reserved)

**Subject heading for pet therapy concept**

animal assisted education, health psychology, human-animal interaction, multidisciplinary approach, intervention in school, emotions

Publication Date  
Dec 2017  
Year of Publication  
2017  
E-Mail Address  
Dice, F., francesca.dice@unica.it  
Publication Month/Season  
Dec  
Key Concepts  
animal assisted education, health psychology, human-animal interaction, multidisciplinary approach, intervention in school, emotions

Animal Assisted Therapy with Care Psychology  
Intervention  
\*Schools  
PsycINFO Classification Code  
Health & Mental Health Treatment & Prevention (3300)

## Google-Doc for Activity

List of seed articles

Database	Seed article titles
Academic Search Complete	The feasibility of brief dog-assisted therapy on university students stress levels: the PAWS study
Academic Search Complete	Therapy Dogs in Academic Libraries: A Way to Foster Student Engagement and Mitigate Self-Reported Stress during Finals



**Systematic Reviews Workshop #1 - Mining seed papers activity**
**Instructions:**

- 1) Search each title in the database of your choice (Academic Search Complete or PsycInfo)
- 2) Mine/analyze the article record for subject headings and/or textwords.
- 3) Insert the subject headings and textwords/keywords found during the activity in the appropriate cell of the table below.

	Textwords/keywords	Subject headings (from Academic Source Complete database)	Subject headings (from APA PsycInfo database)
<b>Concept 1: Pet Therapy</b>	<b>Therapy Dogs</b> dog therapy Coaregivers brief dog-assisted therapy animal-assisted therapy human-canine interaction Guide Dog Pet therapy animal-assisted activities Out-reach programming Human- animal interaction Therapy dogs Positive Symptoms of Schizophrenia Outreach	<u>TREATMENT of psychological stress</u> <u>PET therapy</u> <u>animal-assisted therapy</u> <u>PHYSIOLOGICAL stress</u> <u>TREATMENT effectiveness</u> <u>Psychiatric treatment</u> <u>PSYCHOLOGY of college students</u> <u>TREATMENT of psychological stress</u> <u>BLOOD pressure measurement</u> <u>Self-evaluation</u> <u>Educational Council</u>	Animal assisted therapy, pets, physiological stress, psychological, stress, Interspecies interaction Dogs  Outreach programs caregivers
<b>Concept 2: Post-secondary students</b>	Female undergraduates Campus Blood pressure Exam stress Psychological arousal	<u>UNIVERSITIES &amp; colleges</u> <u>ACADEMIC libraries</u> <u>student engagement</u>  <u>*SCHOOL health services</u> <u>SCHOOL health services</u>	Human Females College Students Academic stress